



Assessment of the Effects of Recruitment Challenges on the Performance of Employees in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS)

DANIEL Dare Joseph¹, HABIBU, AliyuMayere²

¹Department of Business Administration, University of Abuja, Abuja, Nigeria

²National Assembly Complex Three Arms Zone Abuja, Nigeria

Abstract

The study on assessment of the effects of recruitment challenges on the performance of employees observed that most institutions in Nigeria are bedeviled with so many recruitment challenges thus, it examined the effects of recruitment challenges on the performance of employees at the Nigeria's Federal Inland Revenue Services. This ex-post and descriptive study had a population of 2,867 employees that was reduced to a sample size of 400 determined using the Yamane formula. Subsequently, copies of questionnaire were administered on this sample size and 339 representing 84.75 percent were completed, returned and used for the analysis. The analysis was conducted using the simple percentage statistical technique while the multiple regression via the SPSS was used to test the formulated hypotheses. The study found significant but inverse relationships and effects between recruitment challenges and employees' performance. Consequently, the study recommended that serious, concerted and significant efforts should be made by the relevant authorities such as the management of the organization and other supervisory government agencies and departments to discourage political interferences and nepotism as well as to ensure strict adherence to the process and principles of federal character in order to recruit appropriate employee for improved and sustained employees' performances.

Key words: Recruitment, Challenges, Employees, Performance, Organizational Citizenship, Productivity

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Background to the study

The most essential element behind performance in every organization is human resource, because activities in an organization cannot just occur without the presence of human beings that are employees (Bature, 2013). Employees are those persons hired to provide a service to a company or

organization in exchange for compensation and who does not provide these services as part of an independent business. Khan (2015) asserted that it is widely accepted that the human factor is one of the most important asset or resource of any organization, because things are getting done through them. In essence, it is human being that initiates the

existence of any organization in line with the predetermined objectives.

The searching and attraction of the right calibre and quantity of this human factor into every organization is one very serious activity that should be devoid of all forms of sentiments and prejudices. It is an imperative exercise that can make or mar any organization. This exercise is usually an integral part of the human resource policy of all serious organizations and it could be internal or external. Whatever way or method that is chosen at any point in time is diligently thought through. It is often targeted at getting the most qualified and appropriate employees that can and should consistently perform at or above acceptable levels in terms of productivity, commitment, punctuality, organizational citizenship, etc. But as human beings that are fallible, there is rarely any exercise that is not faced with challenges. This challenges could be natural or beyond the control of human beings or they are man made. Challenges in all facet of life are inevitable; likewise recruitment practices are not exceptional. Human resource managers must ensure strict adherence to the laid down policies and strategies with regards to hiring of employees in their respective organizations.

Statement of the problem

It has been observed that most institutions in Nigeria including those in the public and private sectors are bedeviled with so many recruitment challenges. This may be more prevalent the Nigeria's public organizations such as the Federal Inland Revenue Service

(FIRS). These organizations are faced with such recruitment related challenges such as nepotism, political interferences and the lack of adherence to the principles of federal character. These aforementioned challenges are mostly man-made and are from influential Nigerians from the public and political sectors such as the elected members of the National Assembly, political appointees, traditional and religious leaders, influential persons in the private sectors, etc.

It is becoming a new normal that when a recruitment exercise is taking place in such organizations, these aforementioned influential put unbearable pressure on the chief executives of these organizations to employ their recommended persons thus rubbishing the integrity of the exercise and recruiting highly unqualified and inappropriate persons that may turn out poor performances in terms of productivity, commitment, punctuality, organizational citizenship, etc.

The aforementioned challenges are perceived to have affected the qualities of services rendered by most of these institutions. Most particularly, the effectiveness and efficiencies of those recruited through such processes are assumed to be negatively impacted as they are seen to owe their allegiances to the favours done them through such challenges instead of to the system.

Research Questions

Based on the statement of problem, the following research questions were drawn:

- i. To what extent have the recruitment challenges in Federal

- Inland Revenue Services (FIRS) affected the employees' productivity?
- ii. How have the recruitment challenges in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS) affected the employees' organizational citizenship?

Objectives of the study

The main objective of the study was to assess the effects of recruitment challenges on the performance of employees in the Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS). The specific objectives were to:

- i. Ascertain the extent to which recruitment challenges in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS) have affected the employees' productivity.
- ii. Evaluate how the recruitment challenges in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS) have affected the employees' organizational citizenship.

Statement of Hypotheses

H₀₁: Recruitment challenges have not significantly affected the employees' productivity in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).

H₀₂: Recruitment challenges have not significantly affected the employees' organizational citizenship in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Conceptual Framework

Concepts of Recruitment Challenges

Gamaje (2014) defined recruitment as the process of attracting and choosing candidate for employment while Bature (2013) described it as what managers do to develop a pool of qualified candidates for open positions. Ofori and Aryeetey (2011) also described recruitment as a "process of generating a pool of competent individuals to apply for employment within an organization". Opatha (2010) saw it as the process of finding and attracting suitably qualified people to apply for job vacancies in an organization.

Recruitment is a means through which potential applicants get to be aware of vacancies availability around them and develop interest to apply. However, it is a means through which organizations persuade the pool of applicant in large quantity so that they select the best among. It is also all about creating awareness through a proper communication channel to the potential employees who are willing to exchange service for reward internally or externally.

This human resource exercise of searching, creating awareness and attracting the right calibre of potential employees is bedeviled with so many challenges in recent times that significantly affect the integrity and the outcome of the whole exercise. Common amongst these challenges in developing economies like Nigeria include nepotism, political interferences and the lack of adherence to the principles of federal character that are consequences of the interference of influential Nigerians from the

public, private and political sectors such as the elected members of the National Assembly, political appointees, traditional and religious leaders, influential persons in the private sectors, etc.

Nepotism

The word Nepotism is from the Latin word '*Nepo*', which means *nephew*. Arsim (2016) observed that it is from the Italian '*Nepote*', which means the '*son*' and that is a practice of granting special favour to grand children or employment of close relatives. Zulova (2015) described nepotism as giving priority to family members and relatives with regard to employees' selection. It can be deduced from this definition that it is a concept that revolves around recruitment and selection, but goes beyond that to include other human resource management practices such as promotion, job enlargement and job enrichment.

Nepotism replaces the principle of merits such as skills, knowledge, experience, ability, and competency during recruitment and other human resource management practices. Onoshihenko and Williams, (2014) revealed that Ukraine, studies have shown that school leavers by pass formal procedures to take employment through social connection. They also disclosed that in Denmark, research has also shown that 6% of present employees were employed by the same employer that had employed their parents as well.

Nepotism is a global phenomenon that occurs in developed and developing nations as well as public, private, profit and non-profit organizations. However Al-Shawawreh,

(2016) argued that it is practiced more in private organization especially family business where they believe with family continuity in the business.

Political Interference

Political interference can be seen as a different form of nepotism with relation to recruitment, while nepotism is giving preferential treatment to family, relatives and tribal persons, political interference is going a step further by kind of compensating political allies, political thugs and other party loyalist in form of political patronage. Many researchers argued that one of the factors that have ruined and contributed to the decay in public sector performance is the interferences or influences of politicians in the recruitment process. Yaro (2014) observed that, political interferences in recruitment have relegated merit and increased cases of incompetence. Agbo (2010) attested that political interference is father of recruitment challenges because it has led to favoritism, unmerited promotion, appointment of unqualified Directors General and their subordinates in accordance with the whims and caprices of these politicians.

Non-Adherence to the Principles of Federal Character

Many researchers viewed federal character principle as a problem with regard to employment of incompetent employees. Federal character has its own peculiar shortcomings, but adherence to it cannot be seen

as a problem, rather non-adherence to its procedure as enshrined in the federal character principle is the source of recruiting unqualified candidates in the Nigerian public service.

Yaro (2014) observed that the principle of Federal Character has compounded the recruitment problem as it has legalized nepotism and segregation in the exercise in the form of ethnic balancing. Olusoji, Oluwakemi and Mofope (2014) captured that the principles of federal character created more problems than it attempted to solve by glorifying mediocrity over meritocracy. Tukur (2015) opined that the problem of the principle of federal character is deviation from the formula because jobs and appointments are directed toward patronage, connection and bootlicking. He added that the principle is not the problem but the violation of its procedure.

Employees' Performance

The Cambridge Dictionary described performance generally as how well a person or a machine or any other variable does a piece of work or an activity while Mubbsher (2013) specifically defined employees' performance as employees' productivity and efficiency. Dhammika (2013) described employee performance as the amount of output generated from job execution by an employee over a particular period of time in an organization. But Filtin and Alwis (2014) stated that employees' performance constitutes behavior and outcome, but most often it is the outcome that is being measured. Prasetya and Kato (2011) described

employees' performance as the attained outcome of action with the skill of these employees that perform in some situation.

Igbokwe, Chinyeaka and Agbo, (2015) opined that performance is generally and simply the extent to which an individual, a unit or a department carry out task assigned to him or it. It is also a means by which an organization evaluates an employee's input and output level especially in the area of attaining set goals or how well a particular task is accomplished. According to Office of Financial Management, (OFM; 2009) performance measurement is numeric description of an agency's work and the result of the work.

Performance is measured using different variables that are either quantitative or qualitative. It is mostly seen as a quantifiable expression of the amount, cost, or result of activities that indicates how much, how well and at what level product or service is provided during a given time period. The measurement variables are mostly dependent on the nature of the organization and the nature of the tasks or assigned roles to the employees. For the purpose of this study and the organization, employees' performance was measured using employees' productivity and organizational citizenship.

Employee Productivity

Hanaysha, (2016) submitted that employee productivity is one of the emerging concepts in management literature and it is one of the foremost challenges confronting organizations. Kawara (2014) observed that the increasing interest in this concept might

be related to the fact that, organizational success significantly relies on the productivity level of its workforce. However, productivity itself is of immense concern for almost all organizations and managers, therefore, must be taken seriously.

Sultana, Irum, Ahmed and Mehmood (2012) defined employee productivity as the time spent by an employee in executing his or her job duties in order to achieve expected outcomes based on the job description. Massoudi and Hamdi, (2017) described employee productivity as an assessment of the efficiency of a worker or group of workers while Kaimahi (2015) explained the concept of productivity as the employee's ability to produce work or goods and services according to the expected standards set by the employers, or beyond the expected standards. Okereke and Daniel (2012) concluded that employee productivity can be determined by comparing the total output to the total input used by the employee.

The concept of productivity is one that has been used interchangeably with the concept of output. Productivity is the ratio of output or production capacity of the workers in an organization. The ultimate essence of motivating employees is to meliorate productivity.

Organizational Citizenship

Tian, Iqbal, Akhtar, Qalati, Anwar, and Khan (2020) disclosed that the concept of organizational citizenship was first introduced in the early 1980s and was then described as the specified behaviours of employees within an organization. Tambe

(2014) defined it as the voluntary employees' behaviours to prove themselves as good citizens of the organization. Tian, et al (2020) described organizational citizenship as the behaviours that employees of an organization or organizations display outside their formal responsibilities. It is the discretionary behaviour that is not explicitly or directly recognized by the organization's formal reward system. Summarily, it refers to the extent or degree to which employees freely or voluntarily contribute to the success of the organization. It can be referred to as the extent of passion employees possess.

Theoretical Framework and Base

This study was hinged on two goals theories including the Goal-Setting Theory of Motivation developed by Edwin Locke in the 1960's and Robert House's Goal Theory propounded in 1971. These theories were adopted because the essence of every recruitment exercise is to enable the organization and the employees attain their set goals. Edwin Locke in his proposal submitted that organizational or individual goal setting is linked to task performance. Thus, the organization embarks on recruitment to attract the most appropriate persons that can help attain its set goals. Consequently, the alteration of such process is likely to have dire consequences.

Robert House's Goal theory is a general approach to motivation that emphasizes the need to establish goals for intrinsic motivation. It observed that there is a nexus amongst goals attainments, efforts and performances. This nexus remains if the

recruitment employee is commitment (in this case by way of productivity and organizational citizenship) to attaining the goal. Furthermore, the employees most possess the ability (requisite skill, knowledge, qualification and competence, not connection or nepotism) to attain such goals.

Review of Empirical Studies

Mokaya, Mukhweso and Njuguna (2013) conducted a related study and examined the effects of recruitment practices on employee performance in the cooperative sector of Kenya focusing Kenya Union of Savings and Credit Cooperatives (KUSCCO) Limited. The study administered copies of questionnaire on a sample size of 89 selected from amongst 177 employees using the stratified sampling technique. The gathered data was analyzed using the simple percentage, frequencies, mean and standard deviation while the correlation and regression techniques were adopted to determine and explain relationships. The study found that all the adopted sub scales of the recruitment including sources, policies and messages had weak but positive relationship with the employee performances. Specifically, the study found that recruitment sources contributed more to the employee performance.

Rozario, Venkatraman and Abbas (2019) studied the challenges in recruitment and selection process focusing on tertiary and dual education sectors in urban and regional areas of Australia. The study concentrated on identifying the critical aspects of the process

that can influence the decision based on different views of the participants such as, hiring successful and unsuccessful applicants. Various factors including feedback provision, interview panel participation as well as preparations, relevance of interview questions, duration and prejudices were analyzed and their correlations were studied to gain insights in providing suitable recommendations for enhancing the process.

In another related study by Pshdar, Baban, Bayar, Sarhang, Hassan, Shahla, Bawan, Nechirwan, Bayad and Govand (2021) who administered copies of questionnaire at Telecommunication Companies in Erbil-Kurdistan with the aim of determining the recruitment and selection procedures in organizations, and finding out the methodologies that are involved in the process. The gathered data from the 69 respondents was analyzed using SPSS (version 23). The results showed that there was no difference in applicants' race and gender in internal promotion.

Ofobruku and Iheabunike (2013) assessed recruitment practice and organisation performance in selected hospitality businesses in Abuja, Nigeria having observed that the current inability of hospitality businesses to attract and employ the most suitable employee with the right knowledge skills and attitude has resulted in high employees' turnover. Responses were analyzed using weighted mean and the study recommended that related organizations must always strive attract and retain the best hands at all times.

In a related study Tabiu and Nura(2013) examined the effects of HRM on employees' performance at Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto and found that some HRM practices correlate significantly with employees' performance even though all are related. It was however suggested that constant review of the HRM practices for organizations to move with time should be employed.

3.0 METHODOLOGY

The study adopted ex-post facto and descriptive survey design in order to diligently assess and explain the effects of recruitment challenges on the performances of employees at the Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).The study had a population of 2867 employees cutting across different cadres, strata, units, and departments. This population size was reduced to a sample size of 400 using the Yamane formula. Subsequently, copies of questionnaire were administered on the determined sample using the purposive (preference to employees in the HRD) and simple random techniques. Collated data was analyzed using simple percentage while the multiple regression via SPSS was used to test the formulated hypotheses.

This regression models for the selected employees of FIRS HQ were stated as follows:

$$E_{Pro} = \infty + \beta_1 (N_P) + \beta_2 (P_I) + \beta_3 (N_F) + \epsilon_1$$

$$E_{OC} = \infty + \beta_1 (N_P) + \beta_2 (P_I) + \beta_3 (N_F) + \epsilon_1$$

Table 4.1 Model Summary

(*Source: The researcher, 2021*)

Where:

E_{PRO} = Employees' Productivity

E_{OC} = Employees' Organizational Citizenship

∞ is the intercept/slope

β_1 , β_2 , and β_3 were the regression coefficient or slopes that indicated the extent of effects of each sub scale or construct of the independent variable (recruitment challenges). The independent variable was measured by such sub scales as Nepotism (N_P); Political Interference (P_I); and Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F)

ϵ_1 is the stochastic error term.

4.0 DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

This section covered the presentation and the analysis of the data gathered from the opinions of the 339 respondents because, out of the 400 copies of administered questionnaire only 339 copies representing 84.75 response rate. The gathered data was analyzed using SPSS version 25.00 statistical software package.

Test of Hypotheses

Hypothesis One

H₀₁: Recruitment challenges have not significantly affected the employees' productivity in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.975 ^a	.950	.949	.33128

a. Predictors: (Constant), NF, PI, N

Table 4.1 is the model summary table the revealed the extent of the collective effects of all the sub scales of the recruitment challenges including Nepotism (NP); Political Interference (PI); and Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (NF) on the selected employees' productivity

at the organization. The table revealed that the three subscales were collectively responsible for 95% change in the employees' productivities while the outstanding 5% were by other factors not captured in this study.

Table 4.2 ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	694.056	3	231.352	2108.103	.000 ^b
	Residual	36.764	335	.110		
	Total	730.820	338			

a. Dependent Variable: Pro

b. Predictors: (Constant), NF, PI, N

The ANOVA table 4.2 revealed the level of significance (differences in opinions of the different cadres of respondents). Given a level of significance of 5% and an F-statistics value of

2108.103, which is above the level of significance; the table indicated non significance differences in the opinions of the respondents. That showed that there are no significant differences in the opinions of the

different cadre, department and units of the respondents.

Furthermore, with an F-statistics value above the mean square value, the null hypothesis one (H_{01}) is rejected.

Table 4.3 Coefficients^a

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	.224	.050		4.520	.000
1 N	-.617	.056	-.577	-11.058	.000
PI	-.321	.046	-.324	-6.910	.000
NF	-.082	.043	-.084	-1.931	.054

a. Dependent Variable: Pro

$$E_{Pro} = \alpha + \beta_1 (N_P) + \beta_2 (P_I) + \beta_3 (N_F) + \epsilon_i$$

$$E_{Pro} = .224 - .617(N_P) - .321(P_I) - .082(N_F)$$

Table 4.3 is the coefficient table that disclosed the extent of effects of each sub scale of the independent variable, recruitment challenges including Nepotism (N_P); Political Interference (P_I); and Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) on the selected employees' productivity at the organization. These coefficients were further captured in the mathematical function $E_{Pro} = .224 - .617(N_P) - .321(P_I) - .082(N_F)$.

The function indicated that for every 1 per cent change in the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}), there were 61.7% inverse change in Nepotism (N_P); 32.1% inverse

change in Political Interference (P_I); and 8.2% inverse change in Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F). There were inverse changes because the coefficients were negative, which meant reduction in such practices. Thus, it can be deduced from the table and the function that less change in Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) brought about more effects on the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) while more changes in Nepotism (N_P) brought about the same level of changes in the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}). So, Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) had the

most effects on the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) while Nepotism (N_P) had the least effects.

Hypothesis Two

H₀₂: Recruitment challenges have not significantly affected the employees'

organizational citizenship in Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).

Table 4.4 Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.971 ^a	.942	.941	.31423

a. Predictors: (Constant), NF, PI, N

Table 4.4 is the model summary table the revealed the extent of the collective effects of all the sub scales of the recruitment challenges including Nepotism (N_P); Political Interference (P_I); and Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) on the selected employees'

organizational citizenship at the organization. The table revealed that the three subscales were collectively responsible for 97.1% change in the employees' organizational citizenship while the outstanding 5% were by other factors not captured in this study.

Table 4.5 ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	537.229	3	179.076	1813.630	.000 ^b
	Residual	33.078	335	.099		
	Total	570.307	338			

a. Dependent Variable: OC

b. Predictors: (Constant), NF, PI, N

The ANOVA table 4.5 revealed the level of significance (differences in opinions of the different cadres of respondents). Given a level of significance of 5% and an F-statistics value of

1813.63, which is above the level of significance; the table indicated non significance differences in the opinions of the respondents. That showed that there are no significant differences in the opinions of the different cadre, department and units of the respondents.

Furthermore, with an F-statistics value above the mean square value, the null hypothesis two(H_{02}) is rejected.

Table 4.6 Coefficients^a

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	.493	.047		10.463	.000
N	-.490	.053	.518	-9.249	.000
PI	-.230	.044	.262	-5.210	.000
NF	-.175	.040	.203	-4.328	.000

a. Dependent Variable: OC

$$E_{OC} = \infty + \beta_1 (N_P) + \beta_2 (P_I) + \beta_3 (N_F) + \epsilon_1$$

$$E_{OC} = .493 - .49(N_P) - .23(P_I) - .175(N_F)$$

Table 4.6 is the coefficient table that disclosed the extent of effects of each sub scale of the independent variable, recruitment challenges including Nepotism (N_P); Political Interference (P_I); and Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) on the selected employees' organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) at the organization. These coefficients were further

captured in the mathematical function $E_{OC} = .493 - .49(N_P) - .23(P_I) - .175(N_F)$

The function indicated that for every 1 per cent change in the selected organizational citizenship (E_{OC}), there were 49% inverse change in Nepotism (N_P); 23% inverse change in Political Interference (P_I); and 17.5% inverse change in Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F). There

were inverse changes because the coefficients were negative, which meant reduction in such practices (challenges). Thus, it can be deduced from the table and the function that less change in Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) brought about more effects on the selected organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) while more changes in Nepotism (N_P) brought about the same level of changes in the selected organizational citizenship (E_{OC}). So, Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) had the most effects on the selected organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) while Nepotism (N_P) had the least effects.

Discussion of Findings

The computed results of the study based on the opinions of the respondents revealed significant but inverse relationship and effects between the independent variable, recruitment challenges and the dependent variable, employees' performance. The results indicated inverse changes because the computed coefficients were all negative, which simply meant reduction or increase in the recruitment challenges had resulted in increase or decrease in the selected employees' performances respectively.

Specifically and with respect to the adopted sub scales or measurement variables, it can be deduced from the tables and the functions that less change in Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) brought about more effects on the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) and organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) while more changes in Nepotism (N_P) brought about the

same level of changes in the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) and organizational citizenship (E_{OC}). So, Non adherence to principles of Federal Character (N_F) had the most effects on the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) and organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) while Nepotism (N_P) had the least effects.

Thus, overall, recruitment challenges have significantly affected the selected employees' productivity (E_{Pro}) and organizational citizenship (E_{OC}) at Federal Inland Revenue Services (FIRS).

Conclusions and Recommendations

The study found significant but inverse relationship and effects between recruitment challenges and employees' performance. The results indicated inverse changes because the computed coefficients were all negative, which simply meant reduction or increase in the recruitment challenges had resulted in increase or decrease in the selected employees' performances respectively.

Consequently, the study recommended that serious, concerted and significant efforts should be made by the relevant authorities such as the management of the organization and other supervisory government agencies and departments to discourage political interferences and nepotism as well as to ensure strict adherence to the process and principles of federal character in order to recruit appropriate employee for improved and sustained employees' performances.

References

- Agbo, A. (2015). Policies of staff recruitment and selection in the Nigerian Local Government system: A case study of Enugu Local Government service commission.
- Al- Shawawreh (2016). Economics effect of using nepotism and cronyism in employment process in public sector. Vol.8 (1) <https://doi.org/10.5296/rae.v8i1.9227>
- Arsim G. J (2016). The impact of Nepotism and Corruption on the Economy, *Economy and Environmental Studies*, Vol.16(3), 2016.
- Bature, N. (2013). *Human resource management*, Kaduna, Joyce Graphic Printers and publication
- Dhammika, K. (2013). Measuring employee performance in the public sector, Sri Lanka: Testing of two models Department of HRM, University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka. *Kelaniya Journal of HRM*, Vol. 8(1).
- Gamaje A. S.(2014). Recruitment and selection practice in manufacturing SMEs in Japan: An analysis of the link with Business performance. *Ruhuna Journal of Management and Finance*, 1(1) 37-52.
- Hanaysha, J. (2016). Testing the effects of employee empowerment, teamwork, and employee training on employee productivity in higher education sector, *International Journal of Learning & Development*, 6(1)
- Igbokwe, C. J. & Agbodike, F. (2015). Department of public Administration Faculty of management sciences, Namdi- Azikwe University Anambra State. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management*. Review vol.5(3).
- Kaimahi, T. K (2015). *Improving workplace productivity in the public sector council of trade unions*, The New Zealand Council for Trade Unions
- Kawara, P. (2014). Effects of reward systems on employee productivity in Catholic University of Eastern Africa, *International Journal of Recent Research in Commerce Economics and Management*, 1(2)
- Khan, (2015). An empirical analysis of human resource policies on the performance of employees in banking industry: A case study of state Bank in India (SBI): *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development*, 2(2) 308-312.
- Massoudi, A., H. & Hamdi, S. S. A. (2017). The consequence of work environment on employees' productivity, *IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM)*, 19(1).
- Mokaya, S. O., Mukhweso, G. C. & Njuguna, B. W. (2013). Effects of recruitment practices on employee performance in the cooperative sector in Kenya;

- Case of Kenya Union of Savings and Credit Cooperatives *International Journal of Science and Research (IJSR)*, Index Copernicus Value (2013): 4(5) 1476-1481
- MubbasherP. & Maryam J. (2013). Determinants of employee performance in corporate sector: case of an emerging market. *Business & Management Research vol.3(3)*.
- Office of Financial Management (2009). *Performance measure guide*. Budget Division, State of Washington. August, 2009.
- Ofobruku, S. A. &Iheabunike O. B. C. (2013). Assessment of recruitment practice on organisation performance: empirical study of hospitality businesses in Abuja, *European Scientific Journal Vol.9 (29)*
- Ofori, D. & Aryeetey, M., (2011). Recruitment and selection practices in Small and Medium Enterprises, *International Journal of Business Administration*,2(3), 45-60.
- Okereke, C. I. & Daniel, A. (2012).Staff welfare and productivity in Patani local government council, Delta State Nigeria, *Journal of Economics and International Finance*, 2(12).
- Olusoji G, Oluwakemi O. &Mofope A (2014) Meritocracy vs mediocrity: The case of Nigeria Federal Character Principle. *International Review of Social Science and Humanities vol. 7(1)*.
- Onoshihenko, O.& Williams, S. (2014). The role of bias in finding graduate employment in Post Soviet Ukraine: The dark side of job recruitment *,employee relation 36(3) 254-265*.
- Opatha, H., (2010). *Human Resource Management*.Colombo: Author published.
- Prasetya, A. & Kato, M.(2011). The Effect of Financial and Non Financial Compensation to the Employee Performance. *The 2nd International Research Symposium in Service Management, Yogyakarta Indonesia*.
- Pshdar, A. H., Baban, J. O., Bayar, G., Sarhang, S., Hassan, M. A., Shahla, A. A., Bawan, S. Y., Nechirwan, B. I., Bayad, J. A. &Govand, A. (2021). Recruitment and Selection: The Relationship between Recruitment and Selection with Organizational Performance, *International journal of Engineering, Business and Management (IJEEM)*, 5(3) DOI: <https://dx.doi.org/10.22161/ijeem.5.3.1>
- Rozario, S. D., Venkatraman, S. & Abbas, A. (2019) Challenges in Recruitment and Selection Process: An Empirical Study, www.mdpi.com/journal/challengesC *hallenges 2019, 10, 35; doi:10.3390/challe10020035*
- Tabiu, A. & Nura, A. A. (2013). Assessing the effects of human resource management (HRM) practices on employee job performance: a study of

- UsmanuDanfodiyo University
Sokoto, *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly* 5(2)
- Tambe, S. (2014). A study of organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB) and its dimensions: a literature review. *Int. Res. J. Bus. Manag.* 1, 67–73.
- Tian, H., Iqbal, S., Akhtar, S., Qalati, S. A., Anwar, F. & Khan, M. A. S. (2020) The impact of transformational leadership on employee retention: mediation and moderation through organizational citizenship behavior and communication <https://internaljournal.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00314/full>
- Zulova (2015). Legal issues associated with nepotism in work place in the Slovak Republic. Parof Jozet Saterik University in Kosile, *European Scientific Journal*.